

the public do not trust those involved in xenotransplantation, any system of regulation might seem insufficient and it may seem more promising to wait for alternative methods.

Acknowledgement

Grants from the research program BIO-CT97-2242 of the European Commission and from the Swedish Medical Research Council (K99-73X-13153-01A) have supported work on this paper.

Stellan Welin is Associate Professor and Director of the Centre for Research Ethics at Göteborg University. Address for correspondence: Centre for Research Ethics, Göteborg University, Box 700, SE-405 30 Göteborg, Sweden. email: swelin@cre.gu.se

References and notes

- 1 Pig organs are similar enough to human organs; pigs are of approximately the same size as humans and are easy to breed. At the same time, from an evolutionary point of view, pigs are not as close relatives as primates, and the risk of transmission of disease is believed to be considerably lower than from primates.
- 2 Platt J. New directions for organ transplantation. *Nature* 1998; **392**:11-17 (supp).
- 3 Groth CG, Korsgren O, Tibell A, Reinhold F, Wennberg L, Satake M, et al. Clinical islet xenotransplantation - transplantation of porcine islets into diabetic patients. In: Cooper DKC, ed. *Xenotransplantation: the transplant of organs and tissues between species*. Berlin: Springer, 1997: 812-20.
- 4 Butler U. Last chance to stop and think on risks of xenotransplant. *Nature* 1988; **391**:320-4.
- 5 <http://www.islet.org/41>
- 6 Patience C, Takeuchi Y, Weiss RA. Infection of human cells by an endogenous retrovirus of pigs. *Nature Medicine* 1997; **3**:282-6.
- 7 Denner J. Immunosuppression by retroviruses: implications for xenotransplantation. *Annals of New York Academy of Science* 1988; **862**:75-86.
- 8 See reference 7: 75.
- 9 Heneine W, Tibell A, Switzer WM, Sandstrom P, Rosales GV, Mathews A, et al. No evidence of infection with porcine endogenous retrovirus in recipients of porcine islet-cell xenografts. *Lancet* 1998; **352**:695-9. Patience C, Patton GS, Takeuchi Y, Weiss RA, McClure MO, Rydberg L, et al. No evidence of pig DNA or retroviral infection in patients with short-term extracorporeal connection to pig kidneys. *Lancet* 1998; **352**: 699-701.
- 10 Stoye J. No clear answers on safety of pigs as tissue donor source. Commentary. *Lancet* 1998; **352**:666-7.
- 11 Paradis K, Lanford G, Long Z, Heneine W, Sandstrom P, Switzer WM, et al. The XEN 111 Study Group, Otto E. Search for cross-species transmission of porcine endogenous retrovirus in patient treated with living pig tissue. *Science* 1999; **285**:1236-41.
- 12 Weiss RA. Xenografts and retroviruses. *Science* 1999; **285**:1221-2; US FDA. Transcript from biological response modifiers committee, xenotransplantation subcommittee. June 3-4 1999. Washington: Millers Reporting Company Inc, 1999.
- 13 Bach FH, Fishman JA, Daniels N, Proimos J, Anderson B, Carpenter CB, et al. Uncertainty in xenotransplantation: individual benefit versus collective risk. *Nature Medicine* 1998; **4**:141.
- 14 See reference 13:142.
- 15 See reference 13: Bach et al are thus recommending two moratoriums: one before any clinical trials of xenotransplantation start and one after the first clinical trials—before moving to clinical use. However, it could be extremely difficult to put the proposed second evaluative moratorium into effect—if xenotransplantation is successful and no sign of viral infections appear.
- 16 Novak K. US FDA to issue new rules on xenotransplantation. *Nature Medicine* 1998; **4**:876.
- 17 Nuffield Council on Bioethics. *Animal-to-human transplants: the ethics of xenotransplantation*. London: Nuffield Council on Bioethics, 1996: 79.
- 18 Hughes J. Xenografting: ethical issues. *Journal of Medical Ethics* 1998; **24**:18-24.
- 19 Caplan AL. Ethical issues raised by research involving xenografts. *Journal of the American Medical Association* 1985; **254**:3339-43.
- 20 World Medical Assembly Declaration of Helsinki. *Bulletin of Medical Ethics* 1997; May:8-9.
- 21 This is proposed by the recent Swedish Parliamentary Commission on Xenotransplantation. SOU 1999:120. Stockholm: Socialdepartementet, (Ministry of Health) 1999.
- 22 Zion D. Ethical considerations of clinical trials to prevent vertical transmission of HIV in developing countries. *Nature Medicine* 1998; **4**:1-12.
- 23 For the view that consent is a sufficient condition for recruitment (if there is no risk to others involved) see reference 18: Hughes J: 20.
- 24 This is also a recommendation made by the Nuffield Council on Bioethics. See reference 17: 86.
- 25 The case with the poor patients is similar in many ways to other issues of doing clinical research in developing countries.
- 26 This does not hold for bridges. Bridging to obtain a human organ later is meaningless in the clinical setting; in research it may be more acceptable but it imposes other risks on the participants.
- 27 See reference 12: US FDA.
- 28 European Public Concerted Action Group on Biotechnology and the European Public. Europe ambivalent on biotechnology. *Nature* 1997; **387**:845-7.
- 29 Walters L, Palmer JG. *The ethics of human gene therapy*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997: 39.

News and notes

Wisdom in Healthcare

The XVth international congress of the European Society for Philosophy of Medicine and Healthcare will be held from August 16-18 2001, in Lisbon, Portugal. The theme is Wisdom in Healthcare.

Some of the topics covered will be: Kairos in clinical decision making; philosophy and clinical epidemiology; care ethics; the wise healthcare professional, and the wise patient.

Abstracts should be received by **1st January 2001**.

To register and for more information please contact: Prof dr Henk ten Have, ESPMH Secretariat, Dept of Ethics, Philosophy and History of Medicine, Faculty of Medical Sciences, University of Nijmegen, PO Box 9101, 6500 HB Nijmegen, the Netherlands. Fax: ++ 31-24-3540254; email: h.tenhaven@efg.kun.nl